Selenium in Birds

Harry M. Ohlendorf

and

Gary H. Heinz

Introduction

Selenium (Se) is a metalloid trace element that birds and other wildlife need in small amounts for good health. The main purpose of this chapter is to interpret tissue concentrations of Se. However, because food is the main source of Se accumulation for birds and other wildlife, and because dietary concentrations for effects on bird reproduction have been reported, we also provide interpretive information on Se in the diet.

Selenium deficiencies in domestic poultry and livestock occur in some parts of the world and must be corrected by additions of Se to the diet. However, the range of dietary concentrations that provides adequate but nontoxic amounts of Se is narrow compared with the ranges for most other essential trace elements.

In the 1930s, grains grown on seleniferous soils in South Dakota caused reproductive failure when fed to chickens (Gallus domesticus) (Poley and Moxon, 1938). The most drastic incident of Se poisoning in wild birds occurred at Kesterson Reservoir (located on the Kesterson National Wildlife Refuge) in California during the early and mid-1980s (Ohlendorf et al., 1986a, 1988; Ohlendorf and Hothem, 1995; Ohlendorf, 1989, 2002). Water used to irrigate crops in the San Joaquin Valley of California dissolved naturally occurring Se salts from the soil, and when the Se-laden subsurface water was drained from agricultural fields into Kesterson Reservoir, levels of Se that were toxic to birds accumulated in plants and animals used as foods by the birds. Reproductive failure and adult mortality occurred. The
findings at Kesterson Reservoir received extensive publicity and led to a series of laboratory and field studies (summarized in this chapter) that provide one of the best case studies in ecotoxicology during the past 30 years. The integrated field studies at Kesterson and related laboratory studies have been recognized as a “gold standard” in the field of ecotoxicology (Suter, 1993). Similar problems of impaired bird reproduction were subsequently discovered elsewhere in the western United States, most notably in the Tulare Basin in California (Skorupa and Ohlendorf, 1991; Skorupa, 1998a).

High concentrations of Se in foods of wildlife are not limited to areas where soils are naturally high in Se. They also can be the result of the disposal of sewage sludge or fly ash, mining activity, or emissions from metal smelters (Robberecht et al., 1983; Wadge and Hutton, 1986; Cappon, 1991; Skorupa, 1998a; Ratti et al., 2006; Wayland and Crosley, 2006).

An assessment of the toxicity of Se is complicated by its occurrence in many different chemical forms, some differing greatly in their toxicity to birds. The four common oxidation states are selenide (-2), elemental Se (0), selenite (+4), and selenate (+6). Elemental Se is virtually insoluble in water and presents little risk to birds. Both selenite and selenate are toxic to birds, but organic selenides pose the greatest hazard. Among the organic selenides, selenomethionine has been shown to be highly toxic to birds and seems to be the form most likely to harm wild birds because it results in high bioaccumulation of Se in their eggs.

Much has been learned about Se toxicity to birds during the last 25 years; some of that information was summarized in the earlier edition by Heinz (1996). Other reviews in relation to exposure and effects of Se in birds are provided by Skorupa (1998a), O’Toole and Raisbeck (1998), USDI (1998), Eisler (2000), Hoffman (2002), and Ohlendorf (2003). The purpose of this chapter is to identify the concentrations of Se in avian diets and in avian eggs and other tissues that are toxic, and to discuss how different chemical forms of Se and their interactions with other environmental
contaminants can alter toxicity. We also present what are considered background (or no-effect) concentrations of Se from Se-normal areas, when available.

Background and reference area concentrations can be very useful for interpreting the possible toxic thresholds of a contaminant, especially when it is known with some certainty that the reference area has no known source of the contaminant in question. However, because some ‘background’ concentrations of contaminants such as Se are reported from areas where the Se input is unknown, and may not, in fact, be what might be called ‘normal,’ ‘baseline,’ or ‘uncontaminated,’ they should be referred to as ‘reference area’ samples, and a certain degree of caution must be exercised when using those concentrations as being synonymous with safe levels.

The rigorous identification of safe levels of Se, or other contaminants, can really come only from the findings of controlled laboratory dosing studies and carefully designed field studies. In other words, merely because a contaminant like Se is at a level that has been reported from what are believed to be Se-normal areas does not, in itself, prove that the levels are safe.

The manner in which different authors present Se concentrations can be confusing, so it is important to understand the various ways results can be presented. Selenium concentrations typically are reported as micrograms per liter (µg/L) in most fluids (but sometimes µg/g or µg/dL in blood) and milligrams per kilogram (mg/kg) or micrograms per gram (µg/g) in soil, sediment, plant or animal tissues, and diets. Concentrations in soil, sediment, tissues, and diets can be expressed either on a wet-weight (or fresh-weight basis, which is considered to be synonymous) or a dry-weight basis. Although moisture loss during sample processing can be controlled fairly well in the laboratory, it is sometimes difficult to do so under field conditions. Therefore, reporting results on dry-weight basis helps ensure comparability of values.

Conversion from one basis to the other is a function of the moisture content in the sample (which should be reported regardless of which basis is used), as follows:
Dry-weight conc. = wet-weight conc. \times \frac{100}{(100 - \text{percentage moisture})}

In this chapter, we preferentially provide Se concentrations in diets and tissues on dry-weight (dw) basis (unless otherwise noted), and provide typical moisture content of eggs and tissues to enable readers to make conversions. When results were originally reported on wet-weight (ww) basis, the original concentrations are given in parentheses following the approximate dw concentration.

Selenium's ability to interact with other nutrients and environmental contaminants, especially other elements, also sometimes complicates an interpretation of toxic thresholds in tissues of birds. Although we do not attempt a comprehensive review to interpret critical levels of Se in the presence of elevated levels of other pollutants, we include a brief section on interactions, and the reader should be aware that such interactions exist.

**Dietary Requirements versus Toxicity**

In general, the diet is the most important exposure pathway for birds and, whenever possible, dietary concentrations should be included when reporting results or evaluating the effects observed in experimental or field studies. With the previously stated caution about ‘background’ levels of Se in mind, mean background concentrations in diets of freshwater and terrestrial avian species are typically < 3 mg/kg, with thresholds for reproductive impairment in the range of 3 to 8 mg/kg (Table 1).

For birds, as for most other animals, dietary Se requirements appear to be between about 0.05 and 0.5 mg/kg (NAS-NRC, 1976, 1983; Combs and Combs, 1986; Oldfield, 1990, 1998; Eisler, 2000). Excess Se in the diet of female birds during the period just before egg-laying can result in the transfer of Se to the eggs or other tissues at harmful levels, although sensitivity to Se varies among species (Ohlendorf, 1996; Skorupa, 1998a, b; Skorupa and Ohlendorf, 1991). Detwiler (2002) analyzed field-collected eggs and conducted laboratory studies with chickens to determine
partitioning of Se in eggs (to albumen, yolk, and embryo) and to identify
toxicokinetic causes of species variability in sensitivity to Se. As expected,
differences among species, as well as those due to form of Se in the diet, are
complex. Those complexities are not described in detail here, but readers may wish
to read about them in Detwiler’s (2002) work.

Ohlendorf (2003) used data from six laboratory studies with mallards (*Anas
*platyrhynchos*) (Heinz et al., 1987, 1989; Heinz and Hoffman, 1996, 1998; Stanley et al.,
1994, 1996) to calculate an EC$_{10}$ (i.e., the ‘effective concentration’ that caused a 10%
effect; in this case, the dietary concentration that reduced hatching of eggs 10%
below that of the control group in the same study) along with 95% confidence
intervals (95% CI) for the mean Se concentration in the diet. The dietary EC$_{10}$ was
calculated to be 4.9 mg Se/kg, with 95% CI of 3.6 to 5.7 mg Se/kg.

The EC$_{10}$ of 4.9 mg Se/kg was estimated by fitting a logistic regression model to the
available data. It should be noted, however, that the mallard studies used a “dry”
diet that had about 10% moisture. Ohlendorf (2003) used the reported dietary Se
concentrations without adjustment for that moisture content, but an upward
adjustment of the values (by 11%; to about 5.4 mg/kg) would be appropriate to
account for the moisture content of the duck diet.

Adams et al. (2003) used hockey-stick regression on data for egg Se concentrations
and adverse effects in mallards to derive toxicity thresholds, such as EC$_{10}$ values.
Upon further analyses (as described in Ohlendorf, 2007), they found a threshold to
exist when dietary Se was plotted against egg inviability and duckling mortality
(which incorporated the cumulative effects of fertilization success and hatchability
plus survival of ducklings for 6, 7, or 14 days after hatching, as reported for the
different studies). The inflection point occurred at a dietary Se concentration of 3.9
mg/kg. The predicted EC$_{10}$ was 4.4 mg Se/kg (just slightly above the inflection
point) and the 95% CI around the predicted EC$_{10}$ ranged from 3.8 to 4.8 mg Se/kg.
Wayland et al. (2007) used logistic regression to calculate EC_{10} values based on experimental studies of six species (mallard, American kestrel [Falco sparverius], domestic chicken, black-crowned night-heron [Nycticorax nycticorax], eastern screech-owl [Megascops asio] and ring-necked pheasant [Phasianus colchicus]). The EC_{10} was 4.0 mg Se/kg with 95% CI from <0.5 to 7.3 mg Se/kg. The effect of including several species was to widen the confidence limits substantially (compared to mallard EC_{10}), indicating a high degree of difference among species in sensitivity to Se.

Information on forms of Se in invertebrates (as potential diets for birds) is limited, but Andrahennadi et al. (2007) found variability in the Se speciation among aquatic insects that included mayflies (Ephemeroptera), stoneflies (Plecoptera), caddisflies (Trichoptera), and craneflies (Diptera) from streams in Alberta, Canada. Higher percentages of inorganic Se were found in primary consumers, detritivores, and filter feeders than in predatory insects. Among the organic forms, organic selenides constituted a major fraction in most organisms. A form of selenide, believed to represent selenomethionine, varied widely among aquatic insects (from 36-98% of the total Se), indicating a high degree of variability in bioaccumulation potential from diet to eggs. Nevertheless, the chemical forms of Se in aquatic foods of birds have received little study. It is likely that varying chemical forms of Se are present to some degree in plants and animals eaten by birds, yet the toxic concentrations of few Se compounds have been determined in birds.

Interpretive guidelines that have resulted from extensive testing with poultry are provided by Puls (1988). The Se concentrations for diet (as well as those for eggs and other tissues) are helpful guidelines for wild birds as well as domestic poultry. Dietary Se concentrations of less than 0.30 mg/kg are considered to be below the range adequate for good adult health and reproduction, 3.0 to 5.0 mg/kg are high, and above 5.0 mg/kg are toxic (Table 1).

**Egg and Tissue Concentrations**
Eggs

Mean background Se concentrations in eggs of freshwater and terrestrial birds are < 3 mg/kg dw (typically 1.5-2.5 mg/kg dw; concentrations lower than about 0.66 mg/kg dw may indicate inadequate Se in the diet, and maximums for individual eggs are <5 mg/kg dw (Table 1). Moisture content of eggs varies by stage of incubation (decreasing throughout incubation) and by species, but typical moisture content of field-collected eggs is usually 65 to 80% (Ohlendorf and Hothem, 1995). Fresh mallard eggs, such as those collected from laboratory studies, have about 70% moisture (Stanley et al., 1996). The latter value provides a reasonable conversion factor (3.3) for estimating from one basis to the other and, except where noted, is used in this chapter when Se concentrations in eggs were originally reported on wet-weight basis, but the moisture content of samples was not reported.

Laboratory Studies

In a wide variety of species, if one expresses both the diet and eggs on a dry-weight basis, Se concentrations in bird eggs range from roughly equal to about three or four times the concentrations in the diet of the female at the time of egg-laying (Heinz et al., 1987, 1989; Smith et al., 1988; Ohlendorf, 1989; Stanley et al., 1994, 1996; Wiemeyer and Hoffman, 1996; Santolo et al., 1999). However, Se transfer from diet to egg varies by species and the chemical form of Se in the diet.

When birds fed on Se-contaminated diets during the laying season, the exposure was quickly reflected in elevated levels of Se in eggs (Heinz, 1993b; Latshaw et al., 2004; DeVink et al., 2008a). Similarly, when the birds were switched to a clean diet, Se concentrations in eggs declined quickly. When mallard hens were fed a diet containing 15 mg Se/kg (as selenomethionine), levels peaked in eggs (to about 43 to 66 mg Se/kg dw; 13-20 mg Se/kg ww) after about 2 weeks on the treated diet and leveled off at a relatively low level (<16 mg Se/kg dw; <5 mg Se/kg ww) about 10 days after switching to an untreated diet (Heinz, 1993b). The findings of this study
and two others with ring-necked pheasants (*Phasianus colchicus*) (Latshaw et al., 2004) or lesser scaup (*Aythya affinis*) (DeVink et al., 2008a) summarized below have important implications for evaluation of field exposures, such as how quickly and for what duration Se exposure may adversely affect bird reproduction. Concentrations of Se in eggs are especially important because they provide the best samples for evaluating potential adverse reproductive effects (Skorupa and Ohlendorf, 1991). Knowing Se concentrations in food items available to wild birds at a site also can be useful in assessing risks of reproductive effects, but relationships between the available food and concentrations that occur in eggs can vary widely on the basis of physiology and feeding ecology of the birds. Selenium speciation in the diet also may be important in this regard (i.e., plant versus animal diets).

When ring-necked pheasants received feed that contained 9.3 mg Se/kg because of a feed mixing problem, severe effects occurred within 4 days (Latshaw et al., 2004). The rate of egg production decreased and bird aggression increased. About 12% of the hens died within a week; necropsy results were consistent with Se toxicity. After 8 days, the toxic feed was removed and replaced with fresh feed. Egg production, which had dropped by 50%, returned to normal within 10 days of feed replacement. Hatchability of eggs laid from days 8 to 14 after the pheasants received the toxic feed dropped to 35%, and more than 50% of the embryos that survived to the point where they could be examined had deformed beaks and abnormal eyes. Hatchability of eggs laid 21 to 28 days after the hens had received the toxic feed (i.e., 13 to 20 days after it was replaced by new feed) was almost 80%. Similar to the study with mallards, this incident showed a rapid onset of effects and a rapid recovery in response to dietary Se concentrations.

To assess the possible effects of Se on reproduction and fitness (measured as body mass) of lesser scaup, captive scaup were fed a control diet or one supplemented with Se at 7.5 or 15 mg/kg for 30 days to simulate dietary exposure to Se during late spring migration (DeVink et al., 2008a). The treated feed was removed after 30 days,
just before the birds began laying. There was no effect of Se on body mass, breeding
probability, or clutch initiation dates. Selenium concentrations in the first eggs laid
by these birds were 25 to 30 mg/kg in the 7.5-mg/kg and 30 to 35 mg/kg in the 15-
mg/kg treatment groups. Egg Se concentrations of both treatment groups decreased
rapidly after the Se-supplemented feed was removed, and within 8 days and 12
days, respectively, the egg Se concentration was less than 9 mg/kg dw. There was
no significant intraclutch variation in egg Se deposition.

The embryo is the avian life stage most sensitive to Se (Poley et al., 1937; Poley and
Moxon, 1938; Heinz et al., 1987, 1989; Hoffman and Heinz, 1988). Because it is the Se
in the egg, rather than in the parent bird, that causes developmental abnormalities
and death of avian embryos, Se in the egg gives the most sensitive measure for
evaluating hazards to birds (Skorupa and Ohlendorf, 1991). Given the rapid
accumulation and loss patterns of Se in birds (Heinz et al., 1990; Heinz, 1993b; Heinz
and Fitzgerald, 1993b; Latshaw et al., 2004), Se concentrations in eggs also probably
best represent contamination of the local environment. Additional advantages of
measuring Se in eggs are that eggs are frequently easier to collect than adult birds,
the loss of one egg from a nest probably has little effect on a population, and the egg
represents an integration of exposure of the adult female during the few days or
weeks before egg-laying.

The concentration detected in eggs and the toxicity of that concentration seem to
depend on the chemical form of the ingested Se. Organoselenium compounds are
believed to be major forms in plants and animals. One organoselenium compound,
selenomethionine, when fed to breeding mallards was more toxic to embryos than
was selenocystine or sodium selenite (Heinz et al., 1989). Selenomethionine is a
major form of Se in wheat seeds and soybean protein (Olson et al., 1970; Yasumoto
et al., 1988). Hamilton et al. (1990) found selenomethionine to be an excellent model
for Se poisoning in Chinook salmon (Oncorhynchus tshawytscha) when compared
with the toxicity of Se that was biologically incorporated into mosquitofish
(Gambusia affinis) collected at Kesterson Reservoir in California. Yamamoto et al.
(1998) measured Se concentrations in blood and excreta of American kestrels fed
either a selenomethionine-fortified diet or animals from Kesterson. They found no
significant differences in concentrations or in accumulation and depuration of Se
among experimental groups that received Se as selenomethionine or naturally
incorporated in tissue of animals from Kesterson.

When mallards were fed a diet containing 10 mg Se/kg as selenomethionine (and
about 10% moisture), reproductive success was significantly lower in the treated
ducks than in controls, and a small sample of five eggs from the treated birds
contained a mean of about 15 mg Se/kg dw (4.6 mg Se/kg ww) (Heinz et al., 1987).
Because mallards were fed only one dietary concentration of Se in the form of
selenomethionine, no safe level was established in this experiment. All that can be
said is that the safe level in eggs was below about 15 mg Se/kg dw.

In a subsequent study, mallards were fed a diet containing about 10% moisture and
0, 1, 2, 4, 8, or 16 mg/kg of added Se as selenomethionine (Heinz et al., 1989). The
reproductive success of the groups fed 1, 2, or 4 mg Se/kg did not significantly
differ from that of controls; mean Se concentrations in a sample of 15 eggs from each
of these groups were about 2.7, 5.3, and 11 mg/kg dw (0.83, 1.6, and 3.4 mg/kg ww).
The group fed 8 mg Se/kg produced 57% as many healthy ducklings as the controls;
the reduction in numbers was caused mainly by hatching failure and the early death
of those that did hatch. A sample of 15 eggs from this group contained about 36 mg
Se/kg dw (11 mg Se/kg ww). The group fed 16 mg Se/kg failed to produce any
healthy young, and a sample of 10 of their eggs contained an average of about 59 mg
Se/kg dw (18 mg Se/kg ww). Therefore, based on this study, the highest mean Se
concentration in eggs not associated with reproductive impairment was about 11
mg/kg dw (3.4 mg/kg ww), and the lowest mean toxic concentration was 36 mg/kg
dw (11 mg/kg ww).
Lam et al. (2005) subjected the data from this study with mallards (Heinz et al., 1989) to statistical analyses to estimate the threshold for effects on clutch viability. They normalized treatment response for control response and subjected the data to linear regression analysis, and then used a stepwise increment of 0.5-mg Se/kg concentration units followed by a one-tailed, one-sample t-test comparing the percentage of impairment of clutch viability (+95% CI) with zero to derive threshold effect levels of Se in eggs associated with impaired hatchability. They determined that 9 mg Se/kg was the lowest concentration in eggs at which clutch viability was significantly different than zero, and that the value represented an EC8.2 for effects. A recent paper by Beckon et al. (2008) used the mean response data from the same laboratory study with mallards (Heinz et al., 1989) to evaluate potential hormetic effects exhibited by the treatment groups, and found an EC10 of 7.7 mg Se/kg (see later section on Hormesis).

In another study, Heinz and Hoffman (1996) compared the toxicity of three forms of selenomethionine. In nature, selenomethionine occurs almost exclusively in the L form, which is one of the two stereoisomer forms it can take (Cukierski et al., 1989). The other stereoisomer is the D form, and in many feeding studies with birds a mixture of the two forms (seleno-DL-methionine) has been fed. In yeast, most of the Se is in the form of seleno-L-methionine (Beilstein and Whanger, 1986), and in addition to being in the naturally-occurring form, it is biologically incorporated into the yeast. Pairs of breeding mallards were fed 10 mg Se/kg in each of the three forms. The results suggested that seleno-DL-methionine and seleno-L-methionine were of similar toxicity and both were more toxic than the Se in selenized yeast, but the lower toxicity of selenized yeast may have been due to a lower bioavailability of the selenomethionine in the yeast. A sample of eggs from the pairs fed seleno-L-methionine contained a mean of about 30 mg Se/kg dw (8.9 mg Se/kg ww), which resulted in a severe reduction in reproductive success (6.4% hatching of fertile eggs compared to 41.3% for controls). Eggs from pairs fed the seleno-DL-methionine contained a mean of about 31 mg Se/kg dw (9.2 mg Se/kg ww), and hatching of
fertile eggs was 7.6%. Eggs from the pairs fed the selenized yeast contained a mean
of only about 22 mg Se/kg dw (6.6 mg Se/kg ww), and hatching success was 27.0%.
Because even the 22 mg Se/kg derived from the selenized yeast had a profound
effect on reproductive success a toxic threshold was not established, but was
obviously well below 22 mg Se/kg. Three studies were conducted to evaluate the
interactive effects of Se with arsenic (As) (Stanley et al., 1994), boron (B) (Stanley et
al., 1996), or mercury (Hg) (Heinz and Hoffman, 1998), which are described in a later
section (Interactions).

Using the same approach as that described above for the dietary values associated
with reduced egg hatchability in mallards, Ohlendorf (2003) found the EC10 in eggs
was 12 mg Se/kg dw, with 95% CIs of 6.4 to 16 mg Se/kg dw. The EC10 of 12 mg
Se/kg was estimated by fitting a logistic regression model to the results of the six
laboratory studies with mallards mentioned above.

The EC10 for mallard duckling mortality, as reported in Adams et al. (2003), ranged
from 12 to 16 mg Se/kg dw in eggs. These EC10 values are based on a synthesis of
the same six laboratory studies as above, but using the final endpoint of duckling
mortality (the same effects data used in the dietary EC10 evaluation with hockey-
stick regression above); the range of EC10 values reflects different statistical
approaches for analyzing the data. Based on further analyses of those data, Adams
(pers. comm.; see Ohlendorf, 2007) determined that the inflection point of the
hockey stick occurred at an egg Se concentration of 9.8 mg/kg dw, with a predicted
EC10 of about 12 mg/kg dw, which was comparable to that derived by Ohlendorf
(2003). The 95% CI using hockey-stick regression was much narrower (9.7 to
14 mg/kg dw) than that derived by Ohlendorf using logistic regression (6.4 to
16 mg/kg dw). Given that there is a clear egg-Se threshold at which effects begin to
be observed, a unimodal model, such as logistic regression, may result in
exaggerated confidence intervals, particularly in the tails.
In a laboratory study designed to measure the lingering effects of an overwinter exposure to selenomethionine on reproduction, mallards were fed a diet containing 15 mg Se/kg for 21 weeks before the onset of laying (Heinz and Fitzgerald, 1993b). Females began laying after various lengths of time off treatment. This experimental design was not ideal for determining the lowest concentration of Se in eggs associated with reproductive impairment, but the authors were able to make some general conclusions. Some eggs hatched when Se in eggs was as high as about 20 to 30 mg/kg dw (6 to 9 mg/kg ww), but other eggs failed to hatch when Se concentrations were estimated to be between 9.9 and 16 mg/kg dw (3 and 5 mg/kg ww). The authors concluded that the most logical reason why some embryos die while others survive when exposed to a given concentration of Se is that mallard embryos vary in their individual sensitivity to Se.

When black-crowned night-herons were fed a diet containing 10 mg Se/kg as selenomethionine (on close to a dry-weight basis) hatching success of fertile eggs was not reduced (Smith et al., 1988). The eggs of treated herons contained a mean concentration of about 11 mg Se/kg dw (3.3 mg Se/kg ww). The results from this study must be taken with some caution, however, because sample sizes were small (n = 5 pairs per group) and hatching success of fertile eggs of the control group was poor (32%).

Martin (1988) fed Japanese quail (Coturnix coturnix japonica) diets containing 5 or 8 mg Se/kg and chickens 10 mg Se/kg as selenomethionine, respectively. At 5 mg Se/kg, the hatching success of fertile quail eggs (56.4%) was lower than that of controls (76.4%); eggs from treated females contained about 23 mg Se/kg dw (7.1 mg Se/kg ww). At 8 mg Se/kg, the hatching of quail eggs was further decreased to 10.4% (compared with 75.1% for controls in that trial), and Se in eggs averaged about 40 mg/kg dw (12 mg/kg ww). The hatching success of the chickens fed 10 mg Se/kg also was depressed (23.2% compared with 84.5% for controls), and Se in eggs averaged about 36 mg/kg dw (9.6 mg/kg ww; the conversion from ww to dw [3.8]
was based on the contents of chicken eggs containing about 73.6% water [Romanoff and Romanoff, 1949]). No-effect concentrations in the diet or eggs were not determined.

In another study with chickens, diets were supplemented with seleniferous grains in amounts to produce dietary concentrations of 2.5, 5, and 10 mg Se/kg (Poley and Moxon, 1938; Moxon and Poley, 1938). Modern statistical techniques were not applied to these data, and chemical analyses were different from those used today, but at 2.5 mg Se/kg in the diet, the hatching success of fertile eggs was no different from that of controls, and a sample of eggs contained Se at about 15 mg/kg dw in albumen and 3.2 mg/kg dw in yolk (1.75 mg/kg and 1.67 mg/kg ww, respectively; conversions from ww to dw here and below [multiply ww concentrations by 8.3 for albumen and by 1.9 for yolk] were based on the fact that chicken eggs are composed of about 55.8% albumen, 31.9% yolk, and 12.3% shell, and that the moisture content of albumen is about 87.9% while that of yolk is 48.7% (Romanoff and Romanoff, 1949). At 5 mg Se/kg in the diet, the hatching of eggs was "slightly reduced," and Se in egg albumen and yolks averaged about 24 and 5.2 mg/kg dw (2.95 and 2.73 mg/kg ww), respectively. At 10 mg Se/kg, hatching decreased to zero, and albumen and yolks contained about 53 and 7.4 mg Se/kg dw (6.40 and 3.92 mg Se/kg ww), respectively. Based on the percentages of albumen and yolk in chicken eggs and the respective percentages of water in albumen and yolk, a Se threshold of about 10 mg/kg dw (3 mg/kg ww) in whole eggs was associated with reproductive impairment in the study where chickens were fed 5 mg Se/kg; this threshold is similar to the findings of more rigorous recent studies with mallards.

Harmful concentrations of Se in eggs may be of a different magnitude when another chemical form of Se, sodium selenite, is fed to birds. A diet containing 7 mg Se/kg as sodium selenite caused reproductive impairment in chickens but resulted in only about 7.2 and 3.8 mg Se/kg dw (0.87 and 2.02 mg Se/kg ww) in egg albumen and yolk (Ort and Latshaw, 1978).
In another study with chickens, a diet containing 8 mg Se/kg as sodium selenite impaired reproduction, and whole eggs contained from about 5.5 to 7.1 mg/kg dw (1.46 to 1.86 mg/kg ww) of Se (Arnold et al., 1973). The chemical form of Se in chicken eggs seems to be different when sodium selenite rather than selenomethionine is fed (Latshaw, 1975; Latshaw and Osman, 1975).

In mallards, a dietary concentration of 25 mg Se/kg as sodium selenite impaired reproduction but resulted in a mean of only about 4.3 mg/kg dw (1.3 mg/kg ww) of Se in eggs (Heinz et al., 1987). Therefore, although higher dietary concentrations of sodium selenite than selenomethionine must be fed to mallards to harm reproduction, lower concentrations of Se in eggs are associated with harm.

Selenium also may affect egg fertility in some species, but egg fertility is not always reported from field or laboratory studies. Lack of reporting on fertility effects in some studies of Se effects in birds may be due in part to a general practice of simply including infertile eggs as inviable eggs (i.e., “infertility” effects may not be separated from “embryotoxic” effects in the overall measurement of hatchability). Failure to measure infertility as a separate endpoint may be due to the difficulty often associated with distinguishing infertile eggs from those containing embryos that have died very early in development. Nevertheless, decreased fertility is a distinct effect from embryotoxicity, particularly in that it can indicate a mechanism acting on adult, rather than embryonic, physiology. In American kestrels fed selenomethionine at 12 mg Se/kg, egg fertility was significantly reduced (by over 14%) compared to kestrels fed 6 mg Se/kg (Santolo et al., 1999). Results obtained in kestrels suggest infertility may be an important factor contributing to the overall reproductive impairment in some species. However, in mallards (Heinz et al., 1987; Heinz and Hoffman, 1996, 1998) and black-crowned night-herons (Smith et al., 1988) fed 10 mg Se/kg as selenomethionine, egg fertility was not reduced compared with controls. Similarly, fertility was not affected in mallards fed diets containing Se at 7 mg/kg (Stanley et al., 1996) or 16 mg/kg (Heinz et al., 1989) as selenomethionine,
but hatchability of fertile eggs was significantly reduced. Thus, effects on egg
fertility in mallards and night-herons are not likely to be as ecologically significant
as reduced hatchability.

Field Studies

Selenium concentrations in the eggs of marine species are variable, but may be
higher than in freshwater or terrestrial birds, even in remote areas (Ohlendorf, 1989).
For example, eggs of three species (wedge-tailed shearwater \([Puffinus pacificus]\), red-
footed booby \([Sula sula]\), and sooty tern \([Sterna fuscata]\)) were sampled at four
locations throughout the Hawaiian Archipelago, from Oahu to Midway (Ohlendorf
and Harrison, 1986). Mean Se concentrations varied only slightly by location, from
about 4.4 to 5.3 mg/kg dw (1.1 to 1.4 mg/kg ww) for shearwaters, 5.0 to 6.1 mg/kg
(0.76 to 0.92 mg/kg ww) for boobies, and 4.1 to 5.1 mg/kg (1.1 to 1.4 mg/kg ww) for
terns, but all were higher than typical of freshwater species. Henny et al. (1995)
predicted egg concentrations (21.3 or 29.2 mg Se/kg dw, based on different
regressions) from liver concentrations in white-winged scoters \([Melanitta fusca]\)
(mean of 54 mg Se/kg dw for combined males and females; concentration not given
separately for females) based on established liver-egg relationships for freshwater
species (Henny and Herron, 1989; Ohlendorf et al., 1990; Ohlendorf and Hothem,
1995). However, they found that Se concentrations in eggs were only about 10% of
the predicted concentrations, from 2.7 to 4.7 mg/kg dw.

Braune et al. (2002) analyzed eggs of glaucous gulls \([Larus hyperboreus]\), black-legged
kittiwakes \([Rissa tridactyla]\), thick-billed murres \([Uria lomvia]\), and black guillemots
\([Cepphus grylle]\) from the Canadian Arctic. Mean Se concentrations varied somewhat
by species and location, with all means between 1.1 and 2.7 mg/kg dw except for
kittiwakes (with means of 4.4 mg/kg at two locations), so kittiwakes were the only
species with means greater than typical of freshwater and terrestrial birds.

Eggs of common eiders \([Somateria mollissima]\) collected from five locations in the
Baltic Sea near coastal Finland also had median Se concentrations (0.55 mg/kg ww;
about 1.65 mg/kg dw) that were similar to background for freshwater and terrestrial birds (Franson et al., 2000). Thus, there seems to be no consistent difference between marine and other birds.

Using the results of extensive field studies of black-necked stilts (*Himantopus mexicanus*), Skorupa (1998a, 1999) found a threshold of 6 to 7 mg Se/kg in eggs to be associated with impaired egg hatchability. That concentration is about equivalent to the EC$_{10}$ on a clutch-wise (or hen-wise) basis and the EC$_{03}$ on an egg-wise basis. Lam et al. (2005) used the same statistical approach as described above for the laboratory study with mallards to estimate the threshold for effects on stilt clutch viability. They derived an EC$_{11.8}$ of 14 mg Se/kg at which clutch viability was significantly impaired (i.e., greater than zero impairment). It should be noted that the background rate of clutch inviability (when Se concentrations in eggs are <6 mg/kg) is estimated at 8.7% (USDI, 1998).

Studying birds at Kesterson Reservoir in California, Ohlendorf et al. (1986b) used logistic regression to estimate a 50% chance of embryo death or deformity in American coots (*Fulica americana*) when Se concentrations in eggs were about 18 mg/kg dw. The estimated Se concentration causing the same effect in black-necked stilts was 24 mg/kg. The value for eggs of eared grebes (*Podiceps nigricollis*) could not be calculated because even the lowest Se concentration detected in eggs (44 mg/kg) was embryotoxic. The logistic approach is best suited to estimate the 50% effect concentration, not the concentrations of Se in eggs at which embryo deaths and deformities begin for each species. These concentrations would obviously be somewhat lower than the 50% effect levels.

Skorupa and Ohlendorf (1991) examined the relation between Se concentrations in eggs of various aquatic bird species and reproductive impairment at the population level. Embryo deformities were detected in only 3 of 55 populations of birds that had a mean Se concentration of less than 3 mg/kg in eggs (and these deformities were not characteristic of those induced by Se); this is a concentration of Se judged
to represent a background level (Figure 1). However, as discussed earlier, reference area concentrations may not always be the same as concentrations from known uncontaminated areas and, therefore, are not necessarily always synonymous with safe levels. Deformities were detected in 9 of 10 populations of aquatic birds in which the mean Se concentration in eggs exceeded about 48 mg/kg. Their data suggested that a teratogenic threshold at the population level existed between about 13 and 24 mg Se/kg, as illustrated in the figure.

The nature of Se-related deformities makes them a good measure for characterizing the dose-response relation between Se concentrations in eggs and the incidence of severe reproductive impairment in avian populations because 1) the embryo is either deformed or normal (a presence/absence indicator), and 2) the deformities resulting from Se toxicosis are diagnostic of Se toxicosis. It should be noted, however, that the data plotted in Figure 1 represent a population-level analysis and can not be used to infer probability of teratogenesis in individual eggs of known Se content.

Using data on Se in eggs from the Tulare Basin (southern San Joaquin Valley), combined with data from several other western sites where elevated Se was found, Skorupa (1998 a, b; also in USDI, 1998) documented a detailed exposure-response relationship. Statistically distinct teratogenesis response functions were delineated for ducks, stilts, and American avocets (Recurvirostra americana) using the Tulare Basin data. The Tulare curves were used to estimate expected frequencies of teratogenesis for ducks, stilts, and avocets using other sites, and the predicted levels were tested against the observed frequencies from the sites. The predicted and observed frequencies of teratogenesis were not significantly different, so the data were combined to generate final response curves. Using these data, Skorupa (1998b) developed species-specific response curves for stilts and avocets and a composite duck curve (using combined data from gadwalls [Anas strepera], mallards, pintails [A. acuta], and redheads [Aythya americana]).
Based on the response coefficients and their standard errors, the teratogenesis function for ducks, stilts, and avocets were significantly different (Skorupa, 1998b). Within this data set, these responses represent “sensitive” (duck), “average” (stilt), and “tolerant” (avocet) species. The probability of overt teratogenesis in stilts increased markedly when Se concentrations in eggs were greater than 40 mg/kg, with an EC$_{10}$ for teratogenic effects of 37 mg/kg. In contrast, the thresholds for teratogenesis (expressed as an EC$_{10}$) were 23 mg Se/kg in mallards and 74 mg Se/kg in avocets. Sensitivity of these species to effects of Se on egg hatchability followed a similar pattern, with mallards being more sensitive than stilts, which are more sensitive than avocets (USDI, 1998).

**Liver**

Background Se concentrations in livers of freshwater and terrestrial birds are <10 mg/kg dw (Table 1), while livers of marine birds from uncontaminated areas tend to have considerably higher Se concentrations (often 20 mg/kg or more; Dietz et al., 1996; Trust et al., 2000; Grand et al., 2002; Mallory et al., 2004; Elliott, 2005). Typical moisture content is about 70% (Ohlendorf et al., 1990; Stanley et al., 1996).

**Laboratory Studies**

In a manner similar to that for eggs, Se concentrations in the liver respond quickly when birds are placed on or taken off a Se-contaminated diet (Heinz et al., 1990). When mallards were fed a diet containing 10 mg Se/kg, Se concentrations in liver were predicted to reach 95% of equilibrium in 7.8 days; the rate of loss from liver also was rapid, with half-time of 18.7 days. Thus, Se concentrations measured in the livers of birds sampled outside the breeding season are not good predictors of potential reproductive effects. In laboratory studies of reproductive effects, livers of male mallards had higher concentrations of Se than those of females, probably because females excreted part of the Se they had accumulated through egg-laying (e.g., Heinz et al., 1987, 1989; Heinz and Hoffman, 1998). Nevertheless, analysis of
livers of either male or female field-collected birds can provide a useful indication of the relative level of exposure experienced by the population.

Laboratory studies have been conducted with mallards to determine the kinds of lesions and other measurements that can be used for diagnosis of Se toxicosis in birds (Albers et al., 1996; Green and Albers, 1997; O'Toole and Raisbeck, 1997, 1998). Dietary concentrations of added Se ranged from 10 to 80 mg/kg in these studies. Various hepatic lesions were associated with dietary exposures greater than 10 mg Se/kg, and Se concentrations in livers increased in response to the dietary levels. In general, ducks that received diets containing more than 20 mg Se/kg developed a number of lesions of the liver, and those receiving 40 mg/kg or more Se in their diets lost weight and had abnormal changes in the integument (described below) in addition to the liver. Lesions of the integument and liver, and weight loss, when corroborated by elevated Se concentrations in tissues (especially the liver), can be diagnostic of Se toxicosis in birds. It should be noted, however, that some birds died without exhibiting any significant morphological lesions even though they were emaciated. Although a clear threshold Se concentration in livers (or other tissues) for diagnosis of Se toxicity could not be defined, concentrations greater than 10 mg/kg were considered suspicious of Se toxicosis, particularly when accompanied by emaciation, poor quality (and sloughing) of nails, bilaterally symmetrical alopecia of the head and neck, toxic hepatic lesions, and necrosis of maxillary nails.

In laboratory studies with birds fed diets containing selenomethionine, when Se concentrations in the diet and in livers of mallards, night-herons, and eastern screech-owls were expressed on a dry-weight basis, liver concentrations ranged from roughly equal to the dietary concentrations to about three times the dietary levels (Heinz et al., 1987, 1989; Smith et al., 1988; Stanley et al., 1994, 1996; Wiemeyer and Hoffman, 1996). At Kesterson Reservoir, Se concentrations in livers of European starling (Sturnus vulgaris) nestlings (7.5 mg/kg) were only slightly higher than those in the invertebrates being fed to the chicks (6.2 mg/kg) by adults (Santolo, 2007).
In a laboratory study, surviving mallard ducklings fed 40 mg Se/kg as selenomethionine had a mean Se concentration of about 224 mg/kg dw (68 mg/kg ww) in the liver, whereas ducklings that died had a mean of about 198 mg/kg dw (60 mg/kg ww) (Heinz et al., 1988). In another laboratory study, this time with adult male mallards fed 100 mg Se/kg as selenomethionine, the livers of survivors contained a mean of about 142 mg Se/kg dw (43 mg Se/kg ww), and the livers of birds that died contained a mean of about 125 mg Se/kg dw (38 mg Se/kg ww) (Heinz, 1993a).

When adult male mallards were fed 32 mg Se/kg as selenomethionine, they accumulated an average of about 96 mg Se/kg dw (29 mg Se/kg ww) in their livers (Hoffman et al., 1991). One of 10 birds fed 32 mg Se/kg died, and others had hyperplasia of the bile duct and hemosiderin pigmentation of the liver and spleen. Various other sublethal effects, such as elevated plasma alkaline phosphatase activity and a change in the ratio of hepatic oxidized glutathione to reduced glutathione, were observed in ducks with lower hepatic concentrations. At a dietary concentration of 8 mg Se/kg, which caused several of the physiological effects mentioned above, the mean concentration of Se in the liver was about 41 mg/kg dw (12.5 mg/kg ww).

Based on these laboratory studies, in which Se was present as selenomethionine in the diet and was the only element fed at toxic concentrations, mortality of young and adult mallards could occur when hepatic concentrations of Se reach roughly 66 mg/kg dw (20 or more mg/kg ww), and important sublethal effects are likely when the concentrations exceed about 33 mg/kg dw (10 mg/kg ww).

Using Se concentrations in adult female livers to predict when reproductive impairment occurs in birds is not nearly as good as using Se concentrations in eggs, because it is the Se in the egg that actually harms the embryo (Skorupa and Ohlendorf, 1991). Extrapolating from liver to egg will introduce additional uncertainty above that already existing for the egg. However, in a controlled
laboratory study, the correlation between Se concentrations in eggs and in the livers of laying females was demonstrated by feeding mallards selenomethionine (Egg Se_{mg/kg \text{ww}} = -1.10+2.6 (Liver Se_{mg/kg \text{ww}}); R^2 = 0.83; P <0.01; Heinz et al., 1989).

Therefore, when Se concentrations in eggs are not available, the concentrations in the livers of females during the breeding season can be used to estimate whether reproduction might be impaired. When Se concentrations are known for both the eggs and livers of breeding females, judgments on the hazards of Se to reproduction should be based on Se in the egg.

In laboratory studies of reproduction, the livers of male mallards contained more Se than did the livers of females fed the same diets (Heinz et al., 1987; Heinz et al., 1989). Because females may use the egg as a route of Se excretion unavailable to males, one would expect that, in the field, the lowest reproductive effect threshold of Se would be in the livers of laying females and that the livers of males would be less useful in predicting effects on reproduction, even if the males were collected during the breeding season and from the area where reproduction is of concern. The advantage of sampling laying females, however, may be more academic than practical. In nature, it is easier and more likely that a female would be collected before or after egg laying, at which time the concentration of Se in her liver should be the same as in the liver of a male. If one collects breeding males in the wild or has reason to believe that the collected females were not collected during egg laying, a 10-mg/kg dw (3-mg/kg ww) threshold concentration of Se in the liver would be on the low side (and would represent the upper end of background conditions); a value of about 13 to 20 mg Se/kg dw (4 to 6 mg Se/kg ww) might be more appropriate for freshwater birds. However, some marine species typically have higher hepatic Se concentrations even in remote areas (as noted previously), so these values would not be appropriate for those species.

Female mallards that were fed 10 mg Se/kg as selenomethionine had reduced reproductive success and a mean of about 16 mg Se/kg dw (4.7 mg Se/kg ww) in
their livers (Heinz et al., 1987). Because no dietary concentrations below 10 mg/kg were used, a no-effect level of Se in the liver was not determined in this study.

A dietary concentration of 8 mg Se/kg as selenomethionine significantly reduced reproductive success of mallards, and livers of the treated females contained a mean of about 12 mg Se/kg dw (3.5 mg Se/kg ww) (Heinz et al., 1989). In the same study, reproductive success was not significantly different between females fed 4 mg Se/kg and controls, and livers contained a mean of about 7.9 mg Se/kg dw (2.4 mg Se/kg ww). Based on a regression equation of Se concentrations in female livers versus their eggs (Heinz et al., 1989), the threshold Se concentration of 10 mg/kg dw (3 mg/kg ww) in eggs corresponds to a Se value of about 5.3 mg/kg dw (1.6 mg/kg ww) in the liver. However, we do not know whether the data for this regression were linear in the lower end of the Se range. If the data were curvilinear, a value of 10 mg Se/kg dw (3 mg Se/kg ww) in eggs may correspond to a value of roughly 10 mg Se/kg dw (3 mg Se/kg ww) for the liver.

In these laboratory studies with mallards, between 16 and 31 eggs were laid before each female was sacrificed. Depletion of Se through egg laying, therefore, may have been greater in the laboratory than in nature where birds lay fewer eggs. If depletion of Se is greater by females in a laboratory study, the Se concentrations in the liver associated with reproductive impairment could be on the low side.

Separate studies were conducted to evaluate the interactive effects of Se with As (Stanley et al., 1994), B (Stanley et al., 1996), and Hg (Heinz and Hoffman, 1998). The results of the interactions are described in more detail in a later section (Interactions); here we discuss only the effects of the Se treatment by itself. When Se was fed alone at dietary concentrations of 3.5 or 7.0 mg/kg in the B study, the mean Se concentration in livers of females was about 11 mg/kg dw (3.5 mg/kg diet) or 17 mg/kg (7 mg/kg diet) (3.2 and 5.1 mg/kg ww in liver). Hatching success was reduced in the 7-mg Se/kg treatment group when compared to controls and the 3.5-mg Se/kg treatment group. No embryonic deformities were found in that study;
although Se reduced duckling weight, it did not affect duckling survival. When 
ducks were fed Se at 10 mg/kg in both the As and Hg studies, Se accumulated 
significantly in eggs and livers, reduced hatching success and duckling survival (or 
production per pair), and was teratogenic. In the As study, the mean Se 
concentration in livers of ducks receiving the 10-mg/kg diet was 31 mg/kg in 
females and 34 mg/kg in males. In the Hg study, the mean Se concentration in livers 
of hens receiving the 10-mg/kg diet was about 20 mg/kg dw (6.0 mg/kg ww), and 
in males it was about 32 mg/kg dw (9.6 mg/kg ww).

Franson et al. (2007) fed common eiders a diet containing 20 mg Se/kg as seleno-L-
methionine or a diet that was started at 20 mg Se/kg and increased over time to 60 
mg Se/kg. Among the ducks fed the 20-mg Se/kg diet, 57% exhibited lipidosis and 
hypertrophy of Kupffer cells in the liver. Among the ducks fed the 60-mg Se/kg 
diet, 83% exhibited cellular lipidosis and 100% had hypertrophy of Kupffer cells. 
One duck in the 60-mg Se/kg group died after 30 days and another was euthanized 
on day 32 after developing a staggering gait and a 35% weight loss. Selenium 
concentrations in livers averaged 351 mg/kg dw in the 20-mg/kg dietary group and 
735 mg/kg dw in the 60-mg/kg dietary group. The authors of that study stated that 
the effects of Se generally were comparable to those seen in mallards fed similar 
dietary concentrations of selenomethionine; however, the eiders accumulated more 
Se in their livers than did the mallards. For example, in one study (O’Toole and 
Raisbeck, 1997) mallards fed 60 mg Se/kg accumulated about 200 mg Se/kg dw 
(60.6 mg Se/kg ww) in liver versus the 735 mg Se/kg dw for the eiders fed 60 mg 
Se/kg in the Franson et al. (2007) study, leading the authors of the eider study to 
conclude that eiders, and probably other sea ducks, apparently have a higher 
adverse effects threshold of Se in tissues than do freshwater species.

Field Studies

Selenium concentrations in the liver have been used to estimate both exposure and 
effects on birds. For example, livers of adult birds (coots, stilts, and ducks) collected
from Kesterson Reservoir and reference areas showed time-period differences related to collection site and duration of exposure (Ohlendorf et al., 1990). In addition, Se concentrations in pre-fledging juvenile birds of some species were generally similar to those in livers of late-season adults. Geometric means for Se in adult stilts in 1983 were as follows: Kesterson Reservoir – 41.8 mg/kg early, 94.4 mg/kg late nesting season; Volta Wildlife Area – 10.7 mg/kg early, 5.41 mg/kg late nesting season. Selenium concentrations in juveniles were 94.6 mg/kg at Kesterson and 4.10 mg/kg at the Volta Wildlife Area.

Although accumulation in the liver is dose-dependent (Hoffman et al., 1991), the hepatic concentration is only an imprecise estimator of the pathological condition of a bird. The cutoff is not clear between Se concentrations in the livers of birds killed by Se poisoning and others exposed to high concentrations but collected alive. The livers of birds found dead at the Kesterson Reservoir contained 26 to 86 mg Se/kg, whereas the livers of birds shot there contained 38 to 85 mg Se/kg (Ohlendorf et al., 1988).

Selenium toxicosis effects in several species of aquatic birds found at Kesterson Reservoir in 1984-1986 were described previously (Ohlendorf 1989, 1996; Ohlendorf and Hothem, 1995; Ohlendorf et al., 1988, 1990). Those birds exhibited many of the same signs of selenosis as those later found in mallards (as described below), including hepatic lesions, alopecia, necrosis of the beak, and weight loss.

Livers of diving ducks (such as scoters [Melanitta spp.] and scaups [Aythya spp.]) from estuarine habitats have been found to contain higher concentrations of Se than other aquatic birds in the same habitats (Ohlendorf et al., 1986c, 1989, 1991; Henny et al., 1991). One possible reason for the higher concentrations of Se in these diving ducks is that they forage on benthic organisms, which bioaccumulate Se to a higher degree than foods of some other aquatic birds. However, many species of marine birds, including some that feed on planktonic crustaceans or other near-surface organisms, also tend to have higher hepatic Se concentrations than typical of
freshwater birds (Elliott et al. 1992; Dietz et al., 1996; Campbell et al., 2005; Elliott, 2005). Those include species such as Leach’s storm-petrel (*Oceanodroma leucorhoa*), northern fulmar (*Fulmarus glacialis*), black-footed albatross (*Diomedea nigripes*), and black-legged kittiwake that have mean Se concentrations up to 75 mg/kg.

Based on field data, a very high risk of embryonic deformity exists when the mean Se concentration in the livers of a population of birds using non-marine habitats (both sexes included and females not necessarily laying) exceeded about 30 mg/kg dw (U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, 1990). Populations with means below about 10 mg Se/kg dw generally did not have many deformed embryos. Some species of marine birds can accumulate high concentrations of Se in their livers without correspondingly high concentrations in their eggs (e.g., Henny et al., 1995; Braune et al. 2002; Campbell et al., 2005; DeVink et al. 2008b).

**Kidney**

Background Se concentrations in bird kidneys have not been clearly defined, and there is no consistent trend regarding liver/kidney ratios. Selenium concentrations in kidneys of birds from Se-normal areas were somewhat higher than those in the liver (liver/kidney ratios of less than 1), but concentrations in the two tissues were similar in birds from the Se-contaminated Kesterson Reservoir (Ohlendorf et al., 1988, 1990) and in the Imperial Valley of California (Koranda et al., 1979). Selenium concentrations in liver and kidneys of American coots from Kesterson Reservoir and the reference site (Volta Wildlife Area) were significantly correlated ($r = 0.98$). The average moisture content of kidneys was 76-78%, so a conversion factor of 4.3 can be used to estimate from wet-weight to dry-weight concentrations.

When chickens were fed 0.1 mg Se/kg as selenomethionine for 18 weeks, Se concentrations in kidneys (about 3.3 mg/kg dw; 0.77 mg/kg ww) were higher than those in the liver (about 2.0 mg/kg dw; 0.60 mg/kg ww), but when the diet contained 6 mg Se/kg the kidney and liver Se concentrations were essentially equal.
(both about 22 mg/kg dw; 5.2 and 6.6 mg/kg ww, but with different moisture contents assumed for kidney and liver) (Moksnes, 1983).

In a study to determine body distribution of trace elements in black-tailed gulls \((Larus\ crassirostris)\) nesting on Rishiri Island in Hokkaido Prefecture, Japan, Se concentrations in kidneys of both adults (6.9 mg/kg) and juveniles (6.5 mg/kg) were significantly \((P <0.001)\) higher than in livers (adults, 4.5 mg/kg; juveniles, 5.3 mg/kg) (Agusa et al., 2005).

In a laboratory study with mallards (Albers et al., 1996), Se concentrations in livers of surviving ducks were consistently higher than those in kidneys when the ducks were fed diets supplemented with Se at 0 (control), 10, 20, or 40 mg/kg. However, concentrations in the two tissues were more similar among the birds that died during the exposure period. When expressed on a dry-weight basis, Se concentrations in livers were about two or three times the dietary concentration, whereas those in kidneys averaged less than twice the dietary concentration.

Although concentrations of Se in kidneys representative of those diagnostic of harm to adult health or reproductive success are poorly understood, if one had no other information on Se values in tissues other than in kidneys, one could assume a roughly one-to-one correspondence between the concentration of Se in kidney and liver. In this way one could make a preliminary assessment of possible harm to birds, but this assessment would be weak compared to those based on concentrations in eggs or livers.

Muscle

Background Se concentrations in muscle tissues of birds are 1-3 mg/kg (Table 1). Average moisture content of mallard muscle in a laboratory study was 74% (Heinz et al., 1987).

As in eggs and liver, Se concentrations in muscle increase and decrease in response to changes in dietary exposure, but the changes occur more slowly (Heinz et al.,
and diagnostic concentrations for effects are not readily available. Heinz et al. (1990) fed female mallards 10 mg Se/kg as selenomethionine for 6 weeks, followed by 6 weeks off treatment, and measured Se in the liver and breast muscle. By 6 weeks, Se in breast muscle averaged about 24 mg/kg dw (6.3 mg/kg ww). Selenium in the liver had nearly peaked after about 1 week, whereas muscle was projected to reach a peak of about 30 mg Se/kg dw (8 mg Se/kg ww) after 81 days. Likewise, Se was eliminated faster from the liver than from breast muscle, indicating that the two tissues may contain similar concentrations of Se, but only after both reach equilibrium. This difference in accumulation and loss rates between tissues helps explain the variability observed in the muscle-liver relationships at Kesterson Reservoir and the reference site described below (Ohlendorf et al., 1990).

Selenium concentrations in breast muscle from juvenile ducks (Anas spp.) at Kesterson Reservoir and a reference site (Volta Wildlife Area) were measured because of concern about human consumption of ducks harvested in the vicinity of Kesterson (Ohlendorf et al., 1990). Mean Se concentrations were higher at Kesterson than the reference site, and were only slightly lower than those in livers of these birds. However, the relationship between muscle and liver ($R^2 = 0.69$) of the ducks was considerably more variable than that between kidneys and livers of American coots from the two sites ($R^2 = 0.97$). The predictive equation was:

$$\text{Log Se in muscle} = 0.22 + 0.65 \text{log Se in liver.}$$

When mallards were fed 10 mg Se/kg as selenomethionine in a laboratory study, females had similar concentrations of Se in the liver (about 16 mg/kg dw; 4.7 mg/kg ww) and breast muscle (about 19 mg/kg dw; 4.9 mg/kg ww), whereas males had much higher concentration in the liver (about 28 mg/kg dw; 8.6 mg/kg ww) than in breast muscle (about 12 mg/kg dw; 3.1 mg/kg ww) (Heinz et al., 1987). Because the females were laying eggs, they may have been using stores of Se from the liver to incorporate into eggs.
Fairbrother and Fowles (1990) reported more Se in breast muscle (about 22 mg/kg) than in the liver (about 16 mg/kg) of male mallards given drinking water containing 2.2 mg Se/L (as selenomethionine) for 12 weeks. When chickens were fed 0.1 mg Se/kg as selenomethionine for 18 weeks, Se concentrations in breast muscle (about 1.1 mg/kg dw; 0.29 mg/kg ww) were about half of those in the liver (about 1.9 mg/kg dw; 0.60 mg/kg ww), but when fed 6 mg Se/kg in the diet nearly equal Se concentrations were reported in the breast muscle and liver (20 and 22 mg/kg dw; 5.4 and 6.6 mg/kg ww) (Moksnes, 1983).

As was the case with liver, much more Se was accumulated in muscle when ducks received an organic form of Se (selenomethionine) at 10 mg/kg than when fed a diet supplemented with an equivalent concentration of inorganic Se (selenite, which is used routinely, but at much lower concentrations, in poultry diets) (Heinz et al., 1987). Also, females that received the organic Se during the reproductive study accumulated significantly more Se in breast muscle than the males receiving the same treatment.

**Blood**

Background Se concentrations in whole blood of non-marine birds are 0.1-0.4 mg/L on a wet-weight basis (Table 1). However, marine birds inhabiting unpolluted areas often have higher Se concentrations in their blood (e.g., Franson et al., 2000; Wayland et al., 2001, 2008; Grand et al., 2002), and similar findings were observed at Great Salt Lake, UT (Conover and Vest, 2009).

Under uniform sampling conditions, the moisture content of blood is fairly uniform, but under field conditions the moisture content can vary substantially. For example, when mallard blood was sampled over a period of about 3 months by exsanguination in a laboratory study, the dry-weight content of blood averaged 21.70±0.21% (mean ± SE) (Scanlon, 1982). In a laboratory study with kestrels (Yamamoto et al., 1998; Santolo et al., 1999; G.M. Santolo, pers. com.), the dry-weight content of blood averaged 21.40±0.11% (mean ± SE) with a range from 14 to 25%.
However, when kestrels and other raptors were sampled in the field (Santolo and Yamamoto, 1999; G.M. Santolo, pers. com.), the dry-weight content of blood averaged 19.30±0.14% (mean ± SE) with a range from 9 to 32%. In both the laboratory and field studies of kestrels (and other raptors), blood samples were taken in a consistent manner from the birds by the same investigators. However, there was much greater variability in moisture content of birds collected in the field (Variance = 8.3) and than in the lab (Variance = 2.2).

In experimental studies, Se concentrations in blood of mallards (Heinz et al., 1990; Heinz and Fitzgerald, 1993a; O’Toole and Raisbeck, 1997) and American kestrels (Yamamoto et al., 1998; Santolo et al., 1999) reflected dietary exposure levels. Mallards receiving Se (as selenomethionine) at dietary concentrations of 10, 25, or 60 mg/kg had blood-Se concentrations of about 50, 125, or 300 mg/L dw (4.5, 8.9, or 16 mg/L ww) (O’Toole and Raisbeck, 1997). The concentration of Se in blood increased in a time- and dose-dependent manner and reached a plateau after 40 days.

When female mallards were fed increasingly high dietary concentrations of Se as selenomethionine (from 10 mg/kg to 160 mg/kg over a period of 31 days), birds began to die at the end of the 31-day exposure (Heinz et al., 1990). Survivors contained means of about 60 mg Se/kg dw (12 mg Se/kg ww) in the blood on day 31, when their diet was switched to an untreated diet. Half-time for loss of Se from blood was 9.8 days, which was much faster than for muscle (23.9 days). In another study (Heinz and Fitzgerald, 1993a), adult male mallards were fed 10, 20, 40, or 80 mg Se/kg as selenomethionine. Mortality began in the 40- and 80-mg Se/kg treatment groups during the third week on treatment, when samples of blood from surviving ducks in the same pens contained means of about 25 or 70 mg Se/kg dw (5 or 14 mg Se/kg ww). Blood Se concentrations of the ducks fed lower-Se diets plateaued after 8 weeks at about 42 mg/kg dw (8.4 mg/kg ww) for the 10-mg/kg treatment group and 70 mg/kg dw (14 mg/kg ww) for the 20-mg/kg dietary concentration. However, samples of blood were not taken from any of the birds that...
died. Therefore, comparisons of Se concentrations between the dead and the
survivors were not possible.

In American kestrels (Yamamoto et al., 1998), maximal blood concentrations, when
expressed on a dry-weight basis, were about the same as those in the
selenomethionine-supplemented diet. The Se concentration in blood after 77 days on
treatment was 5.0 mg/kg for kestrels receiving the 5 mg/kg diet and 8.9 mg/kg for
those receiving the 9 mg/kg dietary concentration. Selenium concentrations in blood
returned to near the control concentrations in 28 days after the experimental diets
were removed. Selenium concentrations in excreta of the kestrels were higher than
those in blood during the treatment period, indicating that they excrete a substantial
amount of the ingested Se.

To assess the possible effects of Se on reproduction and fitness (measured as body
mass) of lesser scaup, captive scaup were fed a control diet or one supplemented
with Se at 7.5 or 15 mg/kg for 30 days to simulate late spring migration (DeVink et
al., 2008a). The treated feed was removed after 30 days, before the birds began
laying. There was no effect of Se on body mass, breeding probability, or clutch
initiation dates. Blood Se concentrations differed between the treatment groups in
proportion to dose, with mean Se concentrations in blood after 30 days on treatment
(16.3 and 30.8 mg/kg) about twice the concentration in the diet. The half-lives for Se
concentrations in blood were 22 days for the 7.5-mg/kg treatment group and 16
days for the 15-mg/kg treatment group.

When Franson et al. (2007) fed common eiders a diet containing 20 mg Se/kg as
seleno-L-methionine or a diet that was started at 20 mg Se/kg and increased over
time to 60 mg Se/kg (as described in Liver section), the eiders accumulated high
concentrations of Se in their blood. Within 35 days on the high-Se diet the eiders lost
about 30% of their body mass and mean blood Se concentration was about 88 mg/kg
(17.5 mg/kg ww). Body mass of the eiders on the 20-mg Se/kg diet was similar to
that of controls, although mean blood Se in the 20-mg/kg group was about 70
mg/kg (14 mg/kg ww), which was higher than that of controls (about 2 mg/kg; <0.4 mg/kg ww).

Differences in the relationship between blood and liver Se concentrations may be attributed to more rapid initial elimination from liver than blood (Heinz et al., 1990; Wayland et al., 2001) and to binding of Se to inorganic mercury (IoHg) forming an inert Hg-Se protein with a long half-life (Scheuhammer et al., 1998).

Selenium concentrations in wild-trapped birds can be measured in blood as a non-lethal approach for assessing exposure and, when combined with laboratory findings, can be interpreted as to whether exposures are potentially harmful. For example, Se concentrations were measured in terrestrial birds of several species from Kesterson Reservoir, the area surrounding that site, and several reference areas in California from 1994 to 1998 (Santolo and Yamamoto, 1999). Except for loggerhead shrikes (*Lanius ludovicianus*), blood-Se was higher in birds from within Kesterson than in birds from other areas. For shrikes, the mean Se concentrations for birds from Kesterson (13 mg/kg dw) were not significantly different than those from nearby surrounding areas (8.5 mg/kg), although the maximum Se concentration at Kesterson (38 mg/kg) was more than twice the maximum for the surrounding area (16 mg/kg). Among species at Kesterson Reservoir, blood-Se concentration was higher in loggerhead shrikes and northern harriers (*Circus cyaneus*) than in the other species (hawks and owls) sampled. This difference among species is likely due to the differing sizes of foraging ranges of the various species (nesting harriers and young were sampled). Adult starlings collected from nest boxes within Kesterson had a mean Se concentration of 16 mg/kg in blood, and concentrations in eggs were significantly correlated with those in blood (Santolo, 2007).

Based on the information available, we conclude that Se concentrations in blood can indicate recent dietary exposures of birds, but relationships vary among species, and
concentrations in blood can not be clearly related to effects on reproduction or individual health and fitness.

**Integument/Feathers**

Background concentrations of Se in feathers are 1-4 mg/kg, and are typically less than 2 mg/kg (Table 1), with moisture content of about 10%. As is the case for liver and other tissues, Se concentrations may be higher in the feathers of birds from areas with elevated levels of Hg, because of the interactions between these two elements. Analyses of feathers may provide useful information concerning exposures of birds to Se if they are considered carefully. It is important to recognize that the Se may have been deposited into the feathers at the time they were formed (which may have been months earlier and thousands of miles away from the sampling time and location), or the Se may be the result of external contamination (Goede and de Bruin, 1984, 1985, 1986; Goede et al., 1989; Burger, 1993). Concentrations also may have been reduced through leaching. Different kinds of feathers from the same bird may contain different concentrations, depending partly on when and where the feathers were grown during the molt cycle.

Overall, feathers are not very useful for diagnosing potential harm in birds, especially because Se concentrations in them are not good indicators of current or recent exposure (unless, perhaps, while the feathers are growing) (Burger, 1993; Ohlendorf, 1993; USDI, 1998; Eisler, 2000). However, a Se concentration of 5 mg/kg was identified as a threshold warranting further study (USDI, 1998).

Feather loss (bilateral alopecia) is one of the signs of chronic selenosis in birds that may be observed in the field when dietary concentrations are high (Ohlendorf et al., 1988; Ohlendorf, 1996). As mentioned above, laboratory studies have been conducted with mallards to determine the kinds of lesions and other measurements that can be used for diagnosis of Se toxicosis in birds (Albers et al., 1996; Green and Albers, 1997; O’Toole and Raisbeck, 1997, 1998). In general, ducks that received diets containing more than 20 mg Se/kg developed a number of lesions of the
integument. Those receiving 40 mg/kg or more Se in their diets lost weight and had abnormal changes in the integument that involved structures containing hard keratin, such as feathers (alopecia/depterylation [i.e., feather loss]), beaks (necrosis), and nails (onychoptosis [sloughed or broken]). When corroborated by elevated Se concentrations in tissues (especially the liver), the observed integumentary and hepatic lesions, as well as weight loss, can serve for diagnosis of Se toxicosis in birds. It should be noted, however, that some birds died without exhibiting any significant morphological lesions even though they were emaciated.

In conclusion, Se concentrations in feathers can indicate exposure of birds at the time the feathers grew, but concentrations that may be diagnostic of problems have not been developed.

**Biomarkers**

**Biochemical**

A number of studies have described physiological changes that are associated with Se exposure in field-collected or laboratory-exposed birds (Ohlendorf et al., 1988; Hoffman and Heinz, 1998; Hoffman et al., 1989, 1991, 1998). These generally involved changes in measurements associated with liver pathology and glutathione metabolism (e.g., glycogen, protein, total sulphydryl and protein-bound sulphydryl concentrations; and glutathione peroxidase activity). In lesser scaup, results of a field study suggested that corticosterone release may be influenced by complex contaminant interactions in relation to body condition and body size (Pollock and Machin, 2009). When cadmium concentrations were high and birds were in good body condition, there was a negative relationship between liver Se and corticosterone, but not in birds with poor body condition. The overall mean Se concentration in livers was 4.3 mg/kg, with no apparent difference between the two groups.

Wayland et al. (2002) found an inverse association between stress response (measured as corticosterone concentrations following capture) and Se in common
eiders nesting in the Canadian Arctic in 1999. Following capture and blood sampling, the birds were placed in a flight pen on-site for 8 days to examine immune function. Cell-mediated immunity was positively related to hepatic Se (geometric means were 14.1 mg/kg in females, 32.1 mg/kg in males). The heterophil:lymphocyte ratio was inversely related to hepatic Se. In 1998, hepatic Se (geometric mean of 17.2 mg/kg in females) was positively related to body mass, abdominal fat mass, kidney mass, and liver mass.

Hoffman (2002) and Spallholz and Hoffman (2002) provide discussions of the mechanisms and role of Se toxicity and oxidative stress in aquatic birds. As dietary and tissue concentrations of Se increase, increases in plasma and hepatic glutathione peroxidase activities occur, followed by dose-dependent increases in the ratio of hepatic oxidized to reduced glutathione, and ultimately hepatic lipid peroxidation. At a given tissue (or egg) Se concentration, one or more of these oxidative effects were associated with teratogenesis (at about 15 mg Se/kg dw [4.6 mg Se/kg ww] in eggs), reduced growth of ducklings (at about 50 mg Se/kg dw [15 mg Se/kg ww] in liver), diminished immune system (at about 16 mg Se/kg dw [5 mg Se/kg ww] in liver) and histopathological lesions (at about 96 mg Se/kg dw [29 mg Se/kg ww] in liver) in adults. These effects have been documented in field and laboratory studies, as reviewed by Hoffman (2002).

**Morphological**

The characteristic reproductive effects of Se observed in both field and laboratory studies include reduced hatchability of eggs (due to embryo mortality) and a high incidence of embryo deformities (teratogenic effects) (Ohlendorf, 1996, 2003). Selenium-induced abnormalities are often multiple and include defects of the eyes (microphthalmia = abnormally small eyes; possible anophthalmia = missing eyes), feet or legs (amelia = absence of legs; ectrodactylyia = absence of toes), beak (incomplete development of the lower beak, spatulate narrowing of the upper beak), brain (hydrocephaly = a swelling of the skull due to fluid accumulation in the brain;
exencephaly = an opening in the skull that exposes the brain), and abdomen (gastroschisis = an opening of the gut wall, exposing the intestines and other internal organs). Most of these abnormalities are illustrated through photographs that have been published elsewhere (e.g., Ohlendorf et al., 1986a, 1988; Ohlendorf, 1989, 1996; Ohlendorf and Hothem, 1995; O’Toole and Raisbeck, 1998).

Morphological changes in adult birds as a result of chronically consuming diets with excessive Se have been documented in field and laboratory studies, as described in earlier sections and other reviews (e.g., O’Toole and Raisbeck, 1998; Eisler 2000; Ohlendorf, 1989, 1996, 2003). They include poor body condition (i.e., weight loss and loss of body lipids), feather loss, and histopathological changes in tissues. Tissue concentrations that cause these changes are not clear-cut, but effects are sometimes observed when hepatic Se is >10 mg/kg. American kestrels fed a diet containing Se at a concentration of 12 mg/kg lost lean body mass, suggesting that they were burning muscle mass as a result of this exposure (not seen in the lower treatment group fed 6 mg/kg); this may be the cause of wasting seen in other species (Yamamoto and Santolo, 2000).

Interactions

The most studied interactions of Se with other environmental contaminants are between Se and Hg, where each may counteract the toxicity of the other (Cuvin-Aralar and Furness, 1991) but also may increase bioaccumulation in tissues (e.g., Furness and Rainbow, 1990; Heinz and Hoffman, 1998). However, Se toxicity has also been reported to be reduced by elevated levels of lead (Donaldson and McGowan, 1989), copper and cadmium (Hill, 1974), silver (Jensen, 1975), and As (Thapar et al., 1969; Stanley et al., 1994). Despite their common occurrence, biological effects of metal contaminant mixtures are poorly understood and difficult to predict. Interactions between Se and vitamins A, C, and E, as well as sulfur-containing amino acids also have been documented (NAS-NRC, 1976, 1983; Kishchak, 1998;
The interactions may be synergistic or antagonistic in terms of effects on uptake and metabolism, and the degree of interaction is affected by numerous factors. Thus, the topic of interactions is too complex to be addressed in detail in this review, and only a few examples of recent studies are discussed. Nevertheless, some of the interactions of Se with other chemicals can be important factors in the design of field or laboratory studies and in the evaluation of results, and they should be taken into consideration.

After adverse effects characteristic of Se toxicosis were observed in field studies at Kesterson Reservoir, California (described above), a series of laboratory studies was conducted, primarily with mallards, to help interpret the potential toxicity of different forms of Se, dietary sources of Se, and interactions with other dietary components including methionine, protein, and various trace elements that might be encountered in nature. Hamilton and Hoffman (2003) provide a review of the findings from the various laboratory studies, including Se concentrations in diets or tissues associated with the effects.

Here we summarize only the laboratory studies conducted to assess interactions with As (Stanley et al., 1994), B (Stanley et al., 1996), and Hg (Heinz and Hoffman, 1998) in addition to relevant field studies. Each of the laboratory studies involved varying levels of dietary exposures of breeding mallards to Se alone, one of the other elements alone, and Se in combination with the other chemical. In each study, Se and the other chemical caused significant adverse effects on reproduction when present alone in the diet at higher treatment levels, but the interactions varied by chemical. Antagonistic interactions between As and Se occurred whereby As reduced Se accumulation in duck livers and eggs, and reduced the effects of Se on hatching success and embryo deformities when dietary As concentrations were 100 or 400 mg/kg. As the authors noted, however, the importance of the observed As-Se interaction in the environment is unknown because As may not be present in bird food items at contaminated sites in the form used in the study (sodium arsenate).
There was little evidence of interaction between B and Se when ducks were fed the two chemicals in combination. When the diet contained 10 mg Se/kg plus 10 mg Hg/kg, the effects on reproduction were worse than for either Se or Hg alone, even though Se concentrations in eggs were elevated only modestly by the presence of Hg. The 10-mg Se/kg diet produced a mean of about 25 mg Se/kg on a dw basis (7.6 mg Se/kg ww) in eggs, and reduced the hatching success of fertile eggs to 24.0% compared to 44.2% for controls. When 10 mg Hg/kg was fed along with the 10 mg Se/kg, Se concentrations in eggs rose only to about 31 mg/kg dw (9.3 mg/kg ww), but hatching success dropped to 1.4%. Either the embryotoxicity of the Se had been increased by the presence of Hg, the embryotoxicity of the Hg was added to that of the Se, or some combination of these synergistic effects had occurred. In any case, the 31 mg Se/kg measured in eggs was associated with a greater-than-expected level of embryonic death were one to focus only on the Se in the eggs. In addition to the number of young produced per female being significantly reduced in the above study, the frequency of teratogenic effects was significantly increased by the combination of Hg and Se in the diet, and Hg enhanced the storage of Se in duck tissues. Female mallards fed the combination diet had about 1.5 times higher hepatic Se concentrations than those fed the Se-only diet, and male mallards fed the combination diet had almost 12 times the Se concentration of those fed the Se-only diet. In contrast to the synergistic effects on reproduction, the combined Se plus Hg diet was less toxic to adult male mallards than either Se or Hg alone. In male mallards fed only the 10 mg Se/kg diet, livers contained a mean of about 32 mg Se/kg dw (9.6 mg Se/kg ww), but when 10 mg Hg/kg was also in the diet, male livers contained a mean of about 380 mg Se/kg (114 mg Se/kg ww). A value of 380 mg Se/kg in the liver of ducks would almost certainly be equated with severe harm, but the coexistence of about 217 mg Hg/kg (65 mg Hg/kg ww) in the livers seemingly nullified the toxicity of the Se. Likewise, the 217 mg Hg/kg is well above the level normally associated with harm in birds; in this study a level of about 237 mg Hg/kg (71 mg Hg/kg ww) was reported in the male mallards fed only the 10
mg Hg/kg, and Hg-induced toxicity and mortality were observed in this group of males. Obviously, the Hg and Se had conferred a mutually antagonistic effect on each other, but only as far as the adult birds were concerned.

Mercury and Se concentrations in the livers of various free-living carnivorous mammals often are highly correlated in a molar ratio of 1:1 (Scheuhammer, 1987; Furness and Rainbow, 1990; Cuvin-Aralar and Furness, 1991; Eisler, 2000). However, there is no consistent pattern for such a correlation in the livers of birds. For example, in diving ducks from San Francisco Bay, hepatic Hg and Se were correlated, but Se concentrations exceeded Hg concentrations by 6- to 15-fold on molar basis (Ohlendorf et al., 1986c, 1991). Elsewhere, Hg and Se concentrations were positively correlated in some bird livers, but not in others, or they were negatively correlated (see review by Ohlendorf, 1993). These relationships may change as birds remain at the sampling location (due to differential accumulation and loss rates for Hg and Se), they may vary because of differing relative concentrations of the two elements, and other factors (such as the chemical forms present) also may complicate the patterns of bioaccumulation.

When there is a low concentration of Hg, a lower molar ratio is observed; however, at high Hg and Se concentrations in the liver, most Se binds Hg resulting in a Hg:Se ratio greater than 1.0 (Kim et al. 1996). For example, livers of black-footed albatross that contained total mercury (THg) concentrations over 100 mg/kg had an equivalent molar ratio of 1:1 between THg and Se, but such a relationship was unclear when birds had relatively low Hg levels. Studies by Henny et al. (2002) and Spalding et al. (2000) have shown high correlations of Se with IoHg on a molar basis in livers of fish-eating birds. As the THg concentration increased, the percentage present as methylmercury (MeHg) decreased. Those authors suggested that Se may contribute to the sequestration of IoHg, thereby reducing its toxicity. This conclusion would be consistent with the results of a Se-Hg interaction study with mallards by Heinz and Hoffman (1998) described above.
Recent work by Eagles-Smith et al. (2009) provides a useful understanding of Se-Hg relationships. They assessed the role of Se in demethylation of MeHg in the livers of adults and chicks of four waterbird species that commonly breed in San Francisco Bay (American avocets, black-necked stilts, Caspian terns [Hydroprogne caspia; formerly Sterna caspia], and Forster’s terns [Sterna forsteri]). In adults (all species combined) there was strong evidence for a threshold model where demethylation of MeHg occurred above a hepatic THg concentration threshold of 8.51 ± 0.93 mg/kg, and there was a strong decline in percent MeHg values as THg concentrations increased above 8.51 mg/kg. Conversely, there was no evidence for a demethylation threshold in chicks, and they found that percent MeHg values declined linearly with increasing THg concentrations. For adults, they also found taxonomic differences in the demethylation responses, with avocets and stilts showing a higher demethylation rate than terns when concentrations exceeded the threshold, whereas terns had a lower demethylation threshold (7.48 ± 1.48 mg/kg) than avocets and stilts (9.91 ± 1.29 mg/kg). Selenium concentrations were positively correlated with IoHg in livers of birds above the demethylation threshold, but not below, suggesting that Se may act as a binding site for demethylated Hg and may reduce the potential for secondary toxicity.

Similar findings were reported by Scheuhammer et al. (2008) for common loons (Gavia immer) and bald eagles (Haliaeetus leucocephalus), although the thresholds were very different. In liver, both species had a wide range of THg concentrations, substantial demethylation of MeHg, and co-accumulation of Hg and Se. There were molar excesses of Se over Hg up to about 50-60 mg Hg/kg, above which there was an approximate 1:1 molar ratio of Hg:Se in both species. Thus, the amount of Se bound to Hg at any given concentration of THg is likely to vary among species, suggesting that the 8.5 mg Hg/kg threshold described above is not a universal one.

At this time it is not possible to enumerate what concentrations of Se need to be in eggs or tissues to cause harm when certain concentrations of other contaminants
such as Hg are also present in the samples. Likewise, the concentrations of combinations of Se and other chemicals that would lead one to conclude that no harm from Se, or the other chemical, is likely to occur are unknown. However, when elevated concentrations of other contaminants, especially Hg, are found along with Se in eggs or tissues, caution should be exercised in interpreting the significance of the Se (and the other contaminant). When warranted and feasible (due to time and resource constraints), this caution would translate into conducting careful field studies at the contaminated site to determine if reproduction and adult health are normal, compared to an uncontaminated reference area.

Hormesis

Selenium is an essential trace element for bird diets, as described above, and inadequate dietary levels of bioavailable Se may result in low Se in eggs. When poultry diets contain Se concentrations of less than 0.30 mg/kg and eggs contain less than about 0.66 mg/kg dw (0.20 mg/kg ww), they are considered to be below the “adequate” range (Puls, 1988).

Consideration of the hormetic effects of Se may result in lowering of thresholds for diet and eggs described above. A recent paper by Beckon et al. (2008) used the mean response data for the control and five treatment levels from the mallard study by Heinz et al. (1989) to evaluate potential hormetic effects exhibited by the treatment groups. They concluded that the EC\textsubscript{10} from that study was 7.7 mg Se/kg (although their Figure 5 says 7.3 mg Se/kg). Because Se concentrations in bird eggs may be used in setting site-specific water quality standards for Se (e.g., Great Salt Lake; State of Utah, 2008), the difference in conclusions between the Ohlendorf (2003) and Beckon et al. (2008) results are important from a regulatory as well as scientific standpoint. Consequently, further analyses of the available data from the six studies with mallards (Heinz et al., 1987, 1989; Heinz and Hoffman, 1996, 1998; Stanley et al., 1994, 1996) are underway by the authors of this chapter.

Conclusions and Recommendations
Selenium is an essential nutrient for birds, with a narrow range of concentrations between what is a beneficial diet (< 3 mg/kg dw) and what represents a threshold for reproductive impairment (in the range of 3 to 8 mg/kg, depending on species and the form of Se in the diet). When birds eat a high-Se diet, Se levels in the diet are quickly reflected in concentrations in eggs, liver, and blood, but more slowly in muscle. Similarly, when birds are switched from a high-Se diet to one with a lower concentration (or when they migrate from a high-Se area to a Se-normal area), the eggs, liver, and blood adjust relatively quickly to the lower concentrations.

Kidneys are not as useful as livers for diagnosing Se status of birds, although the concentrations in kidneys and livers are highly correlated. In Se-normal areas, concentrations in kidneys tend to be higher than those in the liver, but concentrations in the two tissues are similar in birds from high-Se areas. Feathers can be useful under some circumstances, but it is important to recognize that Se concentrations in feathers reflect the exposure of the bird when the feathers were developing, not their current exposure.

Background, elevated, and various effect levels of Se in bird diets, eggs, and various tissues are summarized in Table 1. We present there a range of effect concentrations because different techniques have been used to develop them, and the reader can select from the range of values those that are appropriate for the degree of protectiveness (conservatism) desired under a particular set of circumstances.

Based on our experience and review of the literature, we recommend the values presented in Table 2 as diagnostic levels for Se concentrations in eggs, livers, and diet to evaluate the probability that Se may be causing adverse effects in birds. Se concentrations in eggs and livers should be considered the primary diagnostic levels, complemented by Se levels in the diet and observed effects on egg hatchability or signs of toxicosis such as those described for liver or other tissues. As stated previously, when Se concentrations are known for both the eggs and livers of
breeding females, judgments on the hazards of Se to reproduction should be based on Se in the egg.

Short of doing a time-consuming study of reproductive success, analysis of eggs is by far the best way to determine status of a population with respect to potential reproductive impairment. No single criterion is available for diagnosis of Se toxicosis in young or adult birds, but Se toxicosis is indicated when elevated Se concentrations in tissues (especially when greater than 20 mg/kg in the liver) are accompanied by emaciation, poor quality of shed nails, bilaterally symmetrical alopecia of the head and neck, toxic hepatic lesions, and necrosis of maxillary nails.

Regardless of which kind of sample is being analyzed (diet, egg, or other tissue), we highly recommend measuring moisture content of the samples and reporting those values along with the Se concentration. The literature contains a mixture of wet-weight and dry-weight concentrations in different media, and it is difficult to relate concentrations on one basis to the other without knowing the moisture content of the samples. This is important because moisture content varies by sample type and handling procedures.

Physiological changes associated with Se exposure in field-collected or laboratory-exposed birds generally involve changes in measurements associated with liver pathology and glutathione metabolism (e.g., glycogen, protein, total sulfhydryl and protein-bound sulfhydryl, concentrations; glutathione peroxidase activity). As dietary and tissue concentrations of Se increase, increases in plasma and hepatic glutathione peroxidase activities occur, followed by dose-dependent increases in the ratio of hepatic oxidized to reduced glutathione, and ultimately hepatic lipid peroxidation. At a given tissue (or egg) Se concentration, one or more of these oxidative effects were associated with teratogenesis (when Se concentrations in eggs reached about 15 mg/kg dw = 4.6 mg/kg ww), reduced growth of ducklings (at about 50 mg Se/kg dw = 15 mg Se/kg ww in liver), diminished immune system (at
about 16 mg Se/kg dw = 5 mg Se/kg ww in liver) and histopathological lesions
(about 96 mg Se/kg dw = 29 mg Se/kg ww in liver) in adults.

The characteristic reproductive effects of Se observed in both field and laboratory
studies include reduced hatchability of eggs (due to embryo mortality) and high
incidence of developmental abnormalities (due to teratogenesis). Selenium-induced
abnormalities are often multiple and include defects of the eyes (microphthalmia
and possible anophthalmia [i.e., abnormally small or missing eyes]), feet or legs
(amelia and ectrodactyly [absence of legs or toes]), beak (incomplete development
of the lower beak, spatulate narrowing of the upper beak), brain (hydrocephaly and
exencephaly [fluid accumulation in the brain and exposure of the brain]), and
abdomen (gastroschisis [an open fissure of the abdomen]).

Selenium interacts with a number of other environmental contaminants and
nutrients of interest for birds. The interactions of Se with Hg have been studied most
extensively, but interactions with As also may be important. Selenium and Hg each
may counteract or increase the toxicity of the other but also may increase
bioaccumulation in tissues. Dietary Hg and Se together were more harmful to
mallard reproduction than either element was alone, while they were less toxic to
adult birds in combination than they were alone. Consequently, where Hg may be
elevated, both Se and Hg should be evaluated. In a similar study of Se and inorganic
As, interactions between As and Se were antagonistic, whereby As reduced Se
accumulation in duck livers and eggs, and reduced the effects of Se on hatching
success and embryo deformities.

Recent work on Se-Hg interactions has shown strong evidence for a threshold above
which demethylation of MeHg occurred, and there was a strong decline in percent
MeHg values as THg concentrations increased above the threshold. Conversely,
there was no evidence for a demethylation threshold in chicks, and percent MeHg
values declined linearly with increasing THg concentrations. For adults, there were
taxonomic differences in the demethylation responses, with avocets and stilts
showing a higher demethylation rate than terns when concentrations exceeded the
threshold, whereas terns had a lower demethylation threshold than avocets and
stilts. Selenium concentrations were positively correlated with IoHg in livers of birds
above the demethylation threshold, but not below, suggesting that Se may act as a
binding site for demethylated Hg and may reduce the potential for secondary
toxicity.

In summary, the ecotoxicology of Se is complex, because of the variable chemical
forms in which it occurs in the environment, its interactions with other
environmental contaminants, and large differences in species sensitivity to the
adverse effects of Se. The most likely effects to be observed in the field are
reproductive impairment, which has been documented at a number of locations
during the past 25 years or so. However, Se toxicosis and mortality of adult birds
also has been observed and may occur when exposures are higher than those
cauing reproductive impairment. The assessment values for diet, eggs, and other
tissues presented in Table 1 can be used to evaluate risks of adverse effects in birds.

Acknowledgments

We appreciate the assistance of G. M. Santolo in providing some of the material for
this chapter through our previous work, and for his helpful review of the draft. C.
M. and T. W. Custer, M. Wayland, and W. N. Beyer also reviewed the manuscript
and provided useful comments.

References

2003. Analysis of field and laboratory data to derive selenium toxicity thresholds for

in black-tailed gulls from Rishiri Island, Japan: Age-dependent accumulation and
transfer to feathers and eggs. Environ. Toxicol. Chem. 24:2107-2120.


Table 1. Published assessment values for effects of dietary or tissue concentrations of Se on birds.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Medium and Level/Status&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</th>
<th>Concentration (mg Se/kg, dw)</th>
<th>Effects</th>
<th>Comments</th>
<th>References</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Diet&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adequate</td>
<td>0.30-1.1</td>
<td>Nutritional needs are met for poultry</td>
<td>Lower dietary concentrations are marginal or deficient, and diets must be fortified</td>
<td>Puls, 1988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>3.0-5.0</td>
<td>Levels are excessive but not considered toxic to poultry</td>
<td>Poultry are relatively sensitive to effects of selenium</td>
<td>Puls, 1988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toxic</td>
<td>&gt;5.0</td>
<td>Reduced egg hatchability and teratogenic effects in embryos/chicks</td>
<td>Poultry are relatively sensitive to effects of selenium</td>
<td>Puls, 1988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background</td>
<td>&lt;3.0</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Deficiencies associated with lower concentrations have not been reported in wild birds</td>
<td>USDI, 1998; Eisler, 2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reproductive impairment</td>
<td>3-8</td>
<td>Reduced egg hatchability; potential deformities in embryos/chicks at upper end of range</td>
<td>Sensitivity varies by species</td>
<td>USDI, 1998; Eisler, 2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reproductive impairment</td>
<td>EC&lt;sub&gt;10&lt;/sub&gt; for reduced egg hatchability</td>
<td>Based on studies of</td>
<td>Wayland et al. (2007)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>mallard, American</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>kestrel, chicken,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>black-crowned</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>night-heron, eastern</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>screech-owl and</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>ring-necked pheasant</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>using logistic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>regression analysis</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reproductive impairment</td>
<td>EC&lt;sub&gt;10&lt;/sub&gt; for reduced egg hatchability</td>
<td>Based on results of six laboratory studies with mallards, using hockey-stick regression analysis</td>
<td>Adams (pers. comm.; see Ohlendorf 2007)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reproductive impairment</td>
<td>EC&lt;sub&gt;10&lt;/sub&gt; for reduced egg hatchability</td>
<td>Based on results of six laboratory studies with mallards, using logistic regression analysis</td>
<td>Ohlendorf, 2003</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Eggs**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adequate</th>
<th>Nutritional needs are met for poultry</th>
<th>Lower dietary concentrations are marginal or deficient, and diets must be fortified</th>
<th>Puls, 1988</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0.66-5.0</td>
<td>(0.20-1.5 ww)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level</td>
<td>Range</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Sensitivity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>5.0-16 (1.5-5.0 ww)</td>
<td>Levels are excessive and upper end of range may be toxic to poultry</td>
<td>Poultry are relatively sensitive to effects of selenium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toxic</td>
<td>&gt;8.2 (&gt;2.5 ww)</td>
<td>Reduced egg hatchability and teratogenic effects in embryos/chicks</td>
<td>Poultry are relatively sensitive to effects of selenium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background</td>
<td>Mean &lt; 3.0 (typically 1.5-2.5); individual eggs &lt;5</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Concentrations may be higher in some marine birds (Ohlendorf and Harrison, 1986; Braune et al., 2002)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repressive impairment</td>
<td>6-7 (about 1.8-2.1 ww)</td>
<td>EC₁₀ on a clutch-wise (or hen-wise) basis and EC₀₃ on egg-wise basis</td>
<td>Based on results of extensive field studies of black-necked stilts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repressive impairment</td>
<td>7.7 (about 2.3 ww)</td>
<td>EC₁₀ for reduced egg hatchability</td>
<td>Based on results of one laboratory study with mallards, assuming hormetic effects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repressive impairment</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>EC₈₂ for impaired clutch viability</td>
<td>Based on results of one laboratory study with mallards, using linear regression analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reproductive impairment</td>
<td>EC_{10} for reduced egg hatchability</td>
<td>Based on results of six laboratory studies with mallards, using logistic regression analysis</td>
<td>Ohlendorf, 2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reproductive impairment</td>
<td>EC_{10} for reduced egg hatchability</td>
<td>Based on results of six laboratory studies with mallards, using hockey stick analysis</td>
<td>Adams (pers. comm.; see Ohlendorf 2007)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reproductive impairment</td>
<td>EC_{11.8} for reduced egg hatchability</td>
<td>Based on results of extensive field studies of black-necked stilts</td>
<td>Lam et al., 2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teratogenicity</td>
<td>Threshold for teratogenic effects on population level</td>
<td>Sensitivity varies widely by species</td>
<td>Skorupa and Ohlendorf, 1991</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teratogenicity</td>
<td>EC_{10} for teratogenic effects in mallard</td>
<td>Mallard is considered a “sensitive” species</td>
<td>Skorupa, 1998b; USDI, 1998</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teratogenicity</td>
<td>EC_{10} for teratogenic effects in stilt</td>
<td>Stilt is considered an “average” species</td>
<td>Skorupa, 1998b; USDI, 1998</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teratogenicity</td>
<td>EC_{10} for teratogenic effects in American avocet</td>
<td>Avocet is considered a “tolerant” species</td>
<td>Skorupa, 1998b; USDI, 1998</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Liver**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adequate</th>
<th>Nutritional needs are met</th>
<th>Lower liver concentrations are marginal or deficient, and diets must be fortified</th>
<th>Puls, 1988</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.2-3.3</td>
<td>(0.35-1.0 ww)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level</td>
<td>Concentration</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Sensitivity to Effects of Selenium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>High</strong></td>
<td>6.6-20 (2.0-6.0 ww)</td>
<td>Levels are excessive but not considered toxic to poultry</td>
<td>Poultry are relatively sensitive to effects of selenium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Toxic</strong></td>
<td>13-76 (4.0-23 ww)</td>
<td>Reduced egg hatchability and teratogenic effects in embryos/chicks</td>
<td>Poultry are relatively sensitive to effects of selenium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background for freshwater and terrestrial species</td>
<td>&lt;10</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Deficiencies associated with lower concentrations have not been documented in wild birds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background for marine species</td>
<td>20 to 75 in some species (see text)</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Found in livers of several species from uncontaminated areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elevated and potentially toxic</td>
<td>10-20</td>
<td>Considered suspicious of selenium toxicosis when accompanied by symptoms listed for toxic effects</td>
<td>Sensitivity varies by species</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Toxic</strong></td>
<td>20-25</td>
<td>Diagnostic when accompanied by emaciation, poor quality of shed nails, bilaterally symmetrical alopecia of the head and neck, hepatic lesions, and necrosis of maxillary nails</td>
<td>Based on field observations and laboratory studies with mallards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Toxic</td>
<td>Many effects on liver and other tissues</td>
<td>Common eiders seem to be more tolerant of selenium in tissues than are mallards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Kidney</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adequate</td>
<td>2.2-5.2</td>
<td>Nutritional needs are met in poultry</td>
<td>Similar to wild birds, concentrations tend to be higher than in liver</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.50-1.2 ww)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Moksnes, 1983; Puls, 1988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>6.4-22</td>
<td>Levels are excessive but not considered toxic to poultry</td>
<td>Similar to wild birds, concentrations tend to be equal to or lower than in liver</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(1.5-5.2 ww)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Moksnes, 1983; Puls, 1988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Muscle</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adequate</td>
<td>0.49-4.9</td>
<td>Nutritional needs are met</td>
<td>Lower muscle concentrations are marginal or deficient, and diets must be fortified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.13-1.3 ww)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Puls, 1988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>1.5-21</td>
<td>Levels are excessive but may not be toxic to poultry</td>
<td>Wide range of concentrations that overlaps with toxic level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.40-5.5 ww)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Puls, 1988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Toxic Level</td>
<td>Toxic Level is below the midpoint of the “high” range</td>
<td>Concentrations in muscle are not very useful for diagnosing current exposure because of long lag in reaching equilibrium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toxic</td>
<td>4.9 (1.3 ww)</td>
<td>None</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Background</th>
<th>None</th>
<th>Accumulation in muscle varies by bird species and chemical form of selenium; concentrations above background in muscle more useful for assessing human health risks than diagnosing toxic effects in birds</th>
<th>USDI, 1998; Eisler, 2000</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Background</td>
<td>1-3</td>
<td>None</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Blood**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Adequate</th>
<th>Nutritional needs are met</th>
<th>Lower blood concentrations are marginal or deficient, and diets must be fortified</th>
<th>Puls, 1988</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.62-0.96</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.13-0.20 ww</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Background</th>
<th>None</th>
<th>Deficiencies associated with lower concentrations have not been documented in wild birds</th>
<th>USDI, 1998; Eisler, 2000</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Background</td>
<td>0.48-1.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.10-0.40 ww)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provisional threshold warranting further study</td>
<td>4.8 (1.0 ww)</td>
<td>Interpretive relationship to effects is limited, but elevated levels associated with effects on reproduction or survival</td>
<td>Blood selenium concentrations are good indicator of current/recent exposure, and especially important for sampling when animals should not be sacrificed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Heinz et al., 1990; Heinz and Fitzgerald, 1993a; O'Toole and Raisbeck, 1997; USDI, 1998; Yamamoto et al., 1998; Santolo et al., 1999; Eisler, 2000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Feathers**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Background</th>
<th>1-4 (typically 1-2)</th>
<th>None</th>
<th>Based on breast feathers; concentrations in feathers vary by type and reflect exposure at the time feathers were grown, rather than current exposure</th>
<th>Burger, 1993; Ohlendorf, 1993; USDI, 1998; Eisler, 2000</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Provisional threshold warranting further study</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Interpretive relationship to effects is limited, but elevated levels associated with exposure when the feathers were developing</td>
<td>Feather selenium concentrations are not good indicator of current/recent exposure, but may be useful if limitations are understood (see text)</td>
<td>Burger, 1993; Ohlendorf, 1993; USDI, 1998; Eisler, 2000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

aTypical moisture content (%) and approximate conversion factor are shown in footnotes for each medium. Values that are shaded are based on domestic poultry rather than wild species.

bVariable moisture; laboratory diet typically ~10%, but natural diet varies widely (<10 to >90%)
<65-80% moisture, varying with species and incubation stage; use 70% (i.e., factor of 3.3) for approximate conversion

70% moisture; use factor of 3.3 for approximate conversion

76-78% moisture, based on limited data; use factor of 4.3 for approximate conversion

74% moisture; use factor of 3.8 for approximate conversion

79% moisture in lab studies, variable under field conditions; use factor of 4.8 for approximate conversion

10% moisture assumed (not well defined); use factor of 1.1 for approximate conversion
Table 2. Recommended assessment values for effects of dietary or tissue concentrations of Se on birds.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Medium and Level/Status/Effectsa</th>
<th>Concentration (mg Se/kg, dw)</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dietb</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background</td>
<td>&lt;3.0</td>
<td>Typical concentrations in diet items for birds; deficiencies associated with low concentrations have not been reported in wild birds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reproductive impairment</td>
<td>&lt;4.0</td>
<td>Low probability for reduced egg hatchability; value based on studies of multiple species</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reproductive impairment</td>
<td>&gt;5.0</td>
<td>Elevated probability for reduced egg hatchability in sensitive species; effects down to this concentration may be measurable in the laboratory but unlikely to be detectable in the field unless dietary concentrations are considerably higher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eggsc</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background</td>
<td>Mean &lt; 3.0 (typically 1.5-2.5); individual eggs &lt;5</td>
<td>Concentrations may be higher in some marine birds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reproductive impairment</td>
<td>&lt;8.0</td>
<td>Low probability for reduced egg hatchability, including effects in sensitive species</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reproductive impairment</td>
<td>&gt;12</td>
<td>Elevated probability for reduced egg hatchability in sensitive and moderately sensitive species</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teratogenicity</td>
<td>&lt;20</td>
<td>Low probability for teratogenic effects in most species, and threshold for statistically discernable incidence in sensitive species such as mallard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teratogenicity</td>
<td>&gt;35</td>
<td>Probability for teratogenic effects in species of “average” sensitivity such as black-necked stilt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liverd</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background for freshwater and terrestrial species</td>
<td>&lt;10</td>
<td>Low probability of adverse effects in these species</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Background for some marine species

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Background</td>
<td>20 to 75 in some species (see text)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elevated and potentially toxic in freshwater and terrestrial species</td>
<td>10-20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toxic</td>
<td>&gt;20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Low probability of adverse effects in these species; must consider species differences compared to freshwater and terrestrial species.

Considered suspicious of selenium toxicosis when accompanied by symptoms listed for toxic effects (see text); sensitivity varies by species.

Diagnostic of Se toxicosis when accompanied by emaciation, poor quality (and sloughing) of nails, bilaterally symmetrical alopecia of the head and neck, hepatic lesions, and necrosis of maxillary nails; based on field observations and laboratory studies with mallards.

Notes: No specific recommendations are made for kidney, muscle, blood, or feathers, although each of them can indicate levels of exposure. Kidney concentration is generally correlated with liver; muscle responds more slowly than eggs, liver, or blood in reflecting current exposure; and feathers reflect exposure at the time they were growing rather than the time of sampling.

- Typical moisture content (%) and approximate conversion factor are shown in footnotes for each medium.
- Variable moisture; laboratory diet typically ~10%, but natural diet varies widely (<10 to >90%)
- 65-80% moisture, varying with species and incubation stage; use 70% (i.e., factor of 3.3) for approximate conversion
- 70% moisture; use factor of 3.3 for approximate conversion
Figure 1. Dose-response relation between mean egg Se and teratogenic classification of aquatic bird populations (from Skorupa and Ohlendorf, 1991). For each dose interval, the observed percentage of populations classified as teratogenic is plotted along with 95% binomial confidence intervals. Sample sizes (number of populations assessed) for each dose interval are listed above the response plots.